

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
*Procurement Card Program Audit*  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

**Prepared For:**

**Ilene Shapiro**  
**Audit Committee**

**Approved by Audit Committee**  
**March 28, 2018**



**Summit County**  
**Internal Audit Department**  
**175 South Main Street**  
**Akron, Ohio 44308**

*Lisa L. Skapura, Director*  
*Brandon Schmidt, Senior Auditor*  
*Mario Warren, Staff Auditor*  
*Dan Weybrecht, Staff Auditor*  
*Amanda Winkelman, Staff Auditor*

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

GENERAL BACKGROUND.....	3
AUDIT OBJECTIVES, METHODOLOGY, AND SCOPE .....	4
DETAILED COMMENTS .....	6

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

**GENERAL BACKGROUND**

Section 301.29 of the Ohio revised Code (ORC) permits counties to use procurement cards and defines under what conditions they may be used. Chapter 198 of the Summit County Codified Ordinances grants authority of the use of procurement cards by employees of Summit County. The policies and definitions defined under Chapter 198 are incorporated in a policy and procedures document created by the Department of Finance and Budget. Chapters 198.02 through 198.04 defines aggregate spending limits on procurement cards, permissible goods and services which may be purchased using the cards, and procedures to be followed in the event a card is misused.

Summit County's Procurement Card Program is designed to allow County employees to make purchases in a manner that reduces paperwork and processing time. The program is an alternative to the traditional purchasing process and can significantly reduce the number of purchase orders and payments processed. It is designed primarily for the purchase of tangible materials, equipment, supplies, and approved services that cost less than \$3,000. Use of the card is meant to simplify and streamline the acquisition process and lower overall transaction costs. The program introduces an electronic invoicing payment process that will significantly streamline the way payments are made by the County.

All cardholders have limits that are defined by the Program Participant and County Program Administrator and are enforced at the point of purchase by Visa. Limitations are established for spending amounts per transaction, monthly spending limits and number of transactions that can be made per day. Several controls concerning classes of merchants are also placed upon the card. In addition, U.S. Bank provides transactional reporting designed to detect irregularities in cardholder usage. Cardholders are also subject to routine and random audits by the County's Department of Internal Audit.

The Procurement Card Program is currently utilized by the following twenty-nine (29) departments/agencies:

- Prosecutor's Office
- Building Standards
- Health District
- Fiscal Office
- County Council
- Engineer's Office
- Clerk of Courts
- Common Pleas Court
- Domestic Relations Court
- Juvenile Court
- Probate Court
- Developmental Disabilities (DD) Board
- Human Resource Commission
- Summit County Law Library
- Veterans Service Commission
- Internal Audit Department
- Children Services Board
- Office of Information Technology
- Executive's Office
  - Purchasing
  - Public Safety
  - Communications
  - Community and Economic Development
  - Job and Family Services
  - Physical Plants
  - Telecommunications
  - Human Resource
  - Environmental Services
  - Animal Control
  - Law, Insurance and Risk Management

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

**AUDIT OBJECTIVES, METHODOLOGY, AND SCOPE**

The primary focus of this review was to provide the Summit County Executive's Office Department of Finance and Budget with reasonable assurance, based on the testing performed, on the adequacy of the system of management control currently in effect for the audit areas. Management controls include the processes for planning, organizing, directing, and controlling program operations, including systems for measuring, reporting, and monitoring performance. Management is responsible for establishing and maintaining effective controls that, in general, include the plan of organization, as well as methods, and procedures to ensure that goals are met. Specific audit objectives include evaluating the policies, procedures, and internal controls related to the Summit County Procurement Card Program.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

Based on the results of our review, we prepared specific issues and recommendations for improvement that were discussed with management. These recommendations, as well as management's unaltered written response, can be found in the following sections of this report.

**Disclaimer:**

We recognize that the Internal Audit Department (IAD) is a participant in the Procurement Card Program, and therefore is unable to audit its own procurement card use and maintain objectivity. Based on this fact, IAD Procurement Card use is excluded from testing and review.

**Specific Objectives:**

1. To review policies and procedures and ensure that they are reasonable and in accordance with ORC §301.29 and Summit County Codified Ordinance Chapter 198.
2. To review the internal control structure of procurement card administration for reasonableness.
3. To review the reconciliation process for reasonableness and accuracy.

**Scope:**

An overview and evaluation of the existing policies, processes, procedures, contracts and internal control structure utilized by the department/agency from 1/1/17 through 11/30/17.

The following were the major audit steps performed:

**OBJECTIVE 1 – TO REVIEW POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND ENSURE THEY ARE REASONABLE AND IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE ORC AND CODIFIED ORDINANCES.**

1. Obtain and review the current policies and procedures to ensure they are reasonable and in accordance with both the Codified Ordinance and ORC.

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

2. Perform testing to verify that each procurement cardholder has a signed County Procurement Card Program Cardholder and Coordinator Acknowledgement form and a Cardholder Application form on file.
3. Meet with the appropriate personnel to obtain an understanding of the current department processes and procedures. Compare those existing processes to the policies and procedures manual for consistency, noting all exceptions. Verify that all departments have departmental procedures on file.
4. Obtain the department's Record Retention Schedule (RC-2) and review for completeness with regard to procurement card documents.
5. Investigate discrepancies and summarize results. Make recommendations where appropriate.

**OBJECTIVE 2 – TO REVIEW THE INTERNAL CONTROL STRUCTURE OF PROCUREMENT CARD ADMINISTRATION**

1. List personnel to be interviewed, the respective interview dates and documentation obtained to gain an understanding of the specific functions and duties for the area of responsibility of the interviewee. (i.e., Mission Statements, Department Procedures, etc.). Document the interview utilizing the questionnaire.
2. Obtain and review a listing of cardholders and a listing of user IDs from U.S. Bank. Confirm all employees on both listings are active per Banner and that a p-card is in the cardholder's possession. Review permissions assigned to users in the U.S. Bank system to ensure that permissions are reasonable. Compare the listing of cardholders to the listing of user IDs with coordinator privileges to ensure that duties are appropriately segregated (e.g., there are no cardholders with coordinator capabilities).
3. Obtain a current Merchant Category Code (MCC) listing from U.S. Bank showing eligible and ineligible transactions. Review for reasonableness.
4. Obtain a listing of spending limits for all approved cardholders. Review to ensure spending limits are reasonable and in compliance with those established in the policies and procedures.
5. Obtain a listing of transactions from the U.S. Bank system to perform detailed testing.
6. Obtain a listing of monthly payments made to U.S. Bank (broken down by account code, purchase order number, etc.). Choose a sample for testing and indicate the sampling technique used. For each payment selected, obtain the corresponding monthly bank statement and perform detailed testing.
7. Investigate discrepancies and summarize results. Make recommendations where appropriate.

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

**DETAILED COMMENTS**

**I. Policies & Procedures**

The *Summit County, Ohio Procurement Card Program Policy and Procedures*, revised and effective 8/18/17, and the Pre-Authorization Signature form was obtained from the County intranet site to gain an understanding of the policies and procedures currently in place and the form used to establish blanket approval authorization.

The cardholder listing from the 2015 P-Card audit was compared to a current listing of cardholders in order to create a complete listing to include any new cardholders that joined the procurement card program since the 2015 audit. IAD then tested to verify that all new cardholders had a cardholder application and a policy and procedure sign-off on file in accordance with the Procurement Card Program Policy and Procedures manual, section III.C.

A listing of all of the current departments that participate in the procurement card program was obtained and compared to the policy and procedure manual testing from the 2015 P-Card audit to verify that all new departments participating in the program submitted their P-Card policy and procedure manual for review in accordance with the Procurement Card Program Policy and Procedures manual, section III.A.

A listing off all current department P-Card coordinators was obtained. IAD then tested to verify that all coordinators had a completed Coordinator Acknowledgment form completed in accordance with the Procurement Card Program Policy and Procedures manual, section III.B.

The Records Retention Schedules (RC-2) for the Department of Finance and Budget and the Fiscal Office were obtained and reviewed for completeness with regard to procurement card documents.

The following issue was noted:

1. Issue:

Upon review of the Department of Finance and Budget's RC-2 Records Retention Schedule (RC-2) regarding the procurement card documents, IAD noted the following record was not included:

- Procurement Card Coordinator Acknowledgment Form.

Recommendation:

IAD recommends that the Department of Finance and Budget update the RC-2 to include all pertinent records and documents and submit to the appropriate parties for approval. This will help to ensure record retention is complete and accurate.

Management Action Plan:

The Procurement Card Coordinator Acknowledgment Form will be added to the next update on the Department of Finance and Budget's RC-2 Records Retention Schedule (RC).

Target Date: 12/31/18

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

## **II. Internal Controls**

Interviews were conducted with Purchasing Director of the Department of Finance and Budget to gain an understanding of the procurement card program, processes, and control environment.

A cardholder and user ID listing generated from the U.S. Bank system was obtained and filtered for active cards. All active cardholders were reviewed to confirm that they were active employees per Banner. All active cardholders were contacted to verify that the correct card was in their possession. The U.S. Bank user ID listing was filtered for users with high level permissions and reviewed for reasonableness.

A listing of cardholders who have program coordinator or program administrator privileges was generated from the cardholder listing and user ID listing, and reviewed to verify that a proper segregation of duties existed. A listing of MCC codes generated from the U.S. Bank system was obtained and reviewed to determine the reasonableness of eligible/ineligible transactions. The cardholder listing was filtered to determine the cardholder's limits and reviewed for reasonableness and compliance.

The Declined Transaction listing was obtained and reviewed for any declined transactions to confirm that transaction limit controls are functioning properly. To further test transaction limit controls, the following detailed testing was performed:

- The number of transactions per day did not exceed established limits.
- The total amount per transaction did not exceed established limits.
- The total amount per day did not exceed established limits.
- Transactions with blocked MCC codes were declined.
- Users who gave final approval for each transaction are authorized to approve transactions.

A Banner report of payments made to U.S. Bank, during the period 1/1/17 through 11/30/17, was generated and a sample of four (4) months was judgmentally selected, one (1) month from each quarter, for detail testing. Monthly U.S. Bank statements corresponding to these payments were obtained and detail testing was performed to ensure the following:

- Sales tax was exempted from all purchases.
- There was appropriate supporting documentation (receipts, order forms, etc.).
- The purchase was reasonable.
- The purchase was properly recorded.
- Proper management approval was recorded on the transaction log and/or the employee has an approved blanket approval form on file.

The following issues were noted:

2. Issue:

Upon detail testing of procurement card transactions, IAD noted four hundred ninety-three (493) out of 3,092 instances, or sixteen percent (16%), where preapproval was not obtained prior to the p-card transaction.

Recommendation:

IAD recommends that the Department of Finance and Budget require that all department cardholders obtain proper pre-approval for transactions and record this pre-approval appropriately. This will help to ensure that all cardholders are in compliance with the Summit County Procurement Card Program Policy and Procedures manual.

**Summit County Executive's Office**  
*Department of Finance and Budget*  
**Procurement Card Program Audit Report**  
**For the Eleven Months Ended November 30, 2017**

Management Action Plan:

The Department of Finance and Budget requires that all cardholders obtain proper pre-approval for all transactions.

The departments that did not have a Pre-Approval form on file be contacted to let them know of the instances where pre-approval was not attained and that they were in violation of the County Policy and they will be reminded that they need to comply with the Policy.

The departments that had the Pre-Approval form on file and did not have all the cardholders in their department included on the form will be contacted to let them know the instances where pre-approval was not attained and that they were in violation of the County Policy and they will be reminded that they need to comply with the Policy. They will also be reminded that when they add a new cardholder, they also need to revise the Pre-Approval Form.

Target Date: 3/31/18

3. Issue:

Upon card verification testing, IAD noted four (4) out of one hundred and twenty-one (121) instances, or three percent (3%), where the employee did not have a p-card in their possession and were listed as an active p-card user.

Recommendation:

IAD recommends that the Department of Finance and Budget conduct an annual verification of employees that are listed as p-card holders to confirm that the employee currently has the assigned p-card in their possession. This will help to ensure proper monitoring and security over the assigned p-cards.

Management Action Plan:

The Department of Finance and Budget will conduct an annual verification of employees that are listed as p-card holders to confirm that the employee currently has the assigned p-card in their possession. This verification will be targeted for January of each year.

Target Date: 1/31/19